

Corporate Policy and Resources Committee



10th February 2025

Title	<i>Car Park Management System at Elmsleigh Surface Car Park and Elmsleigh Multi Storey Car Park tender award</i>
Purpose of the report	To make a decision
Report Author	<i>Bruno Barbosa – Parking Services Operational Manager</i>
Ward(s) Affected	Staines South Staines
Exempt	No
Exemption Reason	N/A
Corporate Priority	Resilience Environment Services
Recommendations	Committee is asked to: <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Approve the tender award as set out in this report; and2. Delegate authority to the Group Head of Corporate Governance to enter into necessary legal documentation to formalise the appointment of the preferred contractor
Reason for Recommendation	<i>Tender procedures were followed, and after evaluation the most economically advantageous bid was identified and recommended for award under this report.</i>

1. Summary of the report

What is the situation	Why we want to do something
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Elmsleigh Surface+MSCP is the largest paid car park operated by SBC, amounts to 51% of all paid parking spaces and £708k (inc VAT) in income for the past 12 months; • The car park is operated under an automated ticket barrier and Pay on Foot system installed in 2016, which is past its end of life, and has little to no support from its provider in the UK. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The current system is prone to frequent failures and defects; • Parts and consumables can only be sourced through the provider, at vastly inflated prices and mark-ups; • If the system fails completely, the car park becomes free to use and carries an income loss risk of around £13k per week; • The lack of support has led to some assets being unavailable for a number of years, (e.g. one terminal has no card payments functionality for over 6 years); • The server has insufficient data redundancy, so any server component failure can lead to the system becoming inoperable and the car park becoming free to park in (last failure resulted in approximately £120k in lost income and IT recovery costs).
This is what we want to do about it	These are the next steps
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We submitted a Capital bid in January 2020 that was approved by CPRC; • Substantial delays in moving forward took place, initially due to Covid-19, and subsequently due to the outsourcing of civil enforcement by Surrey County Council in April 2023 requiring SBC to carefully consider all its options on how to manage its paid car parks; • Once Legal and Procurement requirements were met for a tender, it was advertised as an open tender, with a scoring weight of 60% given to quality and 40% to price, which was evaluated by 3 panel members for quality, and by Procurement for price. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • After the final evaluation scores were calculated, the highest scoring bidder is to be awarded the contract so that they can progress the replacement of the existing system with the system they tendered with.

1.1 This report seeks to have approval from CPRC to award the tender to the highest scoring bidder, by entering into a contract with the said bidder.

2. Key issues

2.1 Elmsleigh Surface+MSCP is the largest paid car park operated by Spelthorne Borough Council and amounts to over half of all car park spaces provided by the Council and the associated income from paid parking fees.

2.2 The existing system was purchased and installed in 2016, but its maintenance and support have proven to be extremely unreliable and overpriced, with the supplier often unable to repair faulty assets and charging extremely high prices for any part or consumable, as well as preventing the use of any other suppliers or providers through contract exclusivity.

2.3 Whilst mechanically mostly reliable, the software and IT infrastructure of the current expired system is extremely unreliable, with regular failures in connection, speed or operability, and the last major failure was caused by a mere single hard drive fault in the local server, costing SBC over £120k in lost income and external IT repair costs (the provider refused to assist in that incident).

2.4 When consulting the tender carried out in 2016, the specification aimed for functionality and setup that was ultimately not delivered by the awarded bidder, so special care was taken to ensure this tender was mindful of the risks in question.

2.5 After the failure, and with the increase in asset failures that the provider was unable or unwilling to repair, or charging extremely high prices for, we submitted a Capital bid for CPRC to assign sufficient budget for the purchase of a new system, which was granted in early 2020.

2.6 Due to Covid19, and then the outsourcing of civil enforcement by Surrey County Council in April 2023, we were unable to proceed with the tender until the Council was able to consider all its options in how to manage its paid car parks.

2.7 Spelthorne Borough Council does not have standard contractual terms and conditions, so the tender was only possible after Legal completed the draft of those terms and conditions for this tender on 31/07/2024. The tender itself was advertised as an open tender on 21/10/2024 by the Procurement Team, bids received by 02/12/2024, quality evaluation concluded on 08/01/2025, and price evaluation concluded on 17/01/2025, with the highest scoring bidder calculated accordingly (the ratio for this tender was 60% for quality and 40% for price).

2.8 In this tender, we specified the requirement for a fully ticketless system, expanding the cashless terminal count but still keeping 2 cash payment machines. The system is to be capable of being remotely managed and require minimal officer interaction. The overall goal of such a setup is to reduce the carbon footprint of the operation by removing the reliance on paper tickets, and also by enabling a mobile workforce able to manage assets from any location where there is a computer terminal connected to the internet.

- 2.9 The tender also required a complete replacement of all poorly sourced data cabling from the previous supplier, as well as requiring bidders to provide clear part prices and a basic maintenance plan that can provide greater control and flexibility to Spelthorne Borough Council when faults or defects are found.
- 2.10 The new system will represent the most advanced system functionalities that exist on the market, providing a new and improved experience to all our customers, ranging from a dedicated app and shopper experience to the integration with our Pay and Display cashless payment provider. Officers will be able to remotely monitor and assist customers from any council premises where there is a computer terminal connected to the internet, including the operation of the intercom system present in all terminals. Customers will have a total of 5 card payment terminals available throughout the car park, as well as 2 central terminals capable of taking cash and card payment too. The system will also enable preventing the entry to the car park by customers that were found to have evaded the charges and/or caused criminal damage in their pursuit to avoid paying the charges applicable.

2.11 Comparison table snapshot:

Current system	New system
Tickets required for entry and exit	Fully ticketless, based on camera recognition of the registration at entry and exit
On site server and support necessary	System can be remotely monitored and managed from any computer with an internet connection
Part prices subject to mark-up and inflation	Defined part prices for the whole life of the contract
Payment can only be made in local paystations	Customers can pay on site, at exit, or using the same app they currently use to pay for parking in our Pay and Display car parks
Card merchant and processor accounts tied to the current supplier	Full control of card merchant and processor accounts, and associated costs per transaction

2.12 We received bids from the following providers:

- (a) Designa Axess UK Ltd
- (b) HUB Parking Technology
- (c) Newpark Security
- (d) Simplyture
- (e) WPS United Kingdom

2.13 The highest scoring bid was as follows:

PRICE SCORES	
Tender price (whole life costs)	Bidder 1 price = £182,440.80
Weighted Price score	Bidder 1 price score = 100.00
Weighted Quality Score	60% x 67.9 = 40.74
Project price weighting x price score	40% x 100.0 = 40.00
Overall score	80.74

3. Options analysis and proposal

3.1 The options available are:

- (a) Option 1 – Recommended. Approve the award of the tender to the highest scoring bidder. Capital budget for this project is already in place (please see para 2.5).
- (b) Option 2 – Not recommended. Reject the award recommendations and continue using the current expired and unsupported system.

4. Financial management comments

4.1 The operation of this car park is more than half of the total parking income budget (total parking income yearly budget is currently £1.557m).

4.2 The capital budget assigned to this project was of £250k, hence unspent capital funds for the award and implementation are savings that can be released. If the highest scoring bid is approved, the total savings from the capital budget assigned would be at least £60k (up to £67.5k), accounting for any reasonable adjustments during the project implementation.

5. Risk management comments

5.1 The current system is no longer supported, and the provider already confirmed they are ceasing to operate in the UK, hence any further period of operation is at risk of complete and unrecoverable failure, leading to total loss of income until a replacement is sourced.

6. Procurement comments

6.1 Procurement were an integral part of the whole process, oversaw the tender advertisement and evaluation, and provided the recommended bidder through a calculated score.

7. Legal comments

7.1 Contract award by the Council must comply with the Contract Standing Orders set out in paragraph 22 of part 4(e) of the Constitution.

7.2 The Council has a statutory duty to deliver best value under the Local Government Act 1999.

7.3 Legal Services (g.legal@spelthorne.gov.uk) have had input throughout and will provide advice and assistance on the preparation of the contract and will approve the final form of the contract and any other ancillary documentation.

8. Other considerations

8.1 N/a.

9. Equality and Diversity

9.1 The new system significantly enhances the accessibility and inclusivity of the car park service provision, by providing significantly more options of payment and a more tailored experienced to each individual customer.

10. Sustainability/Climate Change Implications

10.1 The new system will offer significant reductions in the use of paper and energy for the operation of the car park.

11. Timetable for implementation

11.1 If the recommendation of the report is approved, a standstill period of 8 working days will commence after the contract award is formally notified. It's expected that in March 2025 work will commence for the installation of the new system, with a completion estimated to occur in May 2025.

12. Contact

12.1 Bruno Barbosa b.barbosa@spelthorne.gov.uk

**Please submit any material questions to the Committee Chair and Officer
Contact by two days in advance of the meeting.**

Background papers:

There are none.

Appendices:

Specification of requirements – Appendix 1

Pricing schedule – Appendix 2

Table of final scores – Appendix 3